

Sufi Music Therapy With Makams

As a Potential Intervention for Common Mental Health Disorders
a Comparative Approach

Rumeysa Nur GURBUZ-DOGAN



FCR YAYIN LTD.
General Publication Number: 1668
Certificate Number: 46550
ISNI: 0000000446571968
ROR ID: ror.org/00zznvq98

Imprint: Eskiyezi
Publication Number: 331

Book Title: Sufi Music Therapy With Makams
Subtitle: As a Potential Intervention for Common Mental Health Disorders a Comparative Approach
ISBN: 978-625-5536-44-0
DOI: doi.org/10.70458/fcr.9786255536440

Author: Rumeysa Nur Gurbuz-Dogan | orcid.org/0000-0001-7377-4179
Institution: Ankara Sosyal Bilimler University
ROR ID: ror.org/025y36b60

Book Type: Monograph
Language: English
Dimensions: 160 x 240 mm
Edition: 1
Pages: 270 pages (xvi+254)

E-Publication Date: 18 August 2025 (Print: FCR Yayin Ltd., 2022)
Place of Publication: Ankara, Türkiye
Layout and Cover Design: FCR

Subject Categories

BIC: Religious & ceremonial music
BISAC: REL117000 - Religion / Islam / Theology
THEMA: Religious & ceremonial music
LC Classification: BP189.65 - Islam – Sufism – Music
DEWEY: 297.4 - Islam – Sufism
WoS Category: Arts & Humanities - Music
WoS Citation Topics Meso: Religious Studies
WoS Citation Topics Micro: Sufi Music and Mysticism
Scopus Subject Areas: 1207 - Music

Citation: Gurbuz-Dogan, Rumeysa Nur. *Therapy With Makams: As a Potential Intervention for Common Mental Health Disorders a Comparative Approach*. Ankara: FCR Yayin Ltd., 2025.

© All rights reserved | FCR YAYIN LTD.



Hacı Bayram Mah. Boyacılar Sk. No: 14/1 06050
Altındağ-Ankara/TÜRKİYE • Tel: +90 (312) 310 08 60
www.fcr.com.tr • fcr@fcr.com.tr

Sufi Music Therapy With Makams

As a Potential Intervention for Common Mental Health Disorders
a Comparative Approach

Rumeysa Nur GURBUZ-DOGAN

Ankara 2025

About the Author

Rumeysa Nur GURBUZ-DOGAN

Rumeysa Nur Gurbuz-Dogan, PhD, is a lecturer in the division of psychology of religion at the Social Sciences University of Ankara, Turkey. She received her bachelor's in theology at Ankara University in 2013 and then completed her MA at Durham University, the UK, in 2016, under the program of 'Spirituality, Theology, and Health'. She has developed the Sufi music therapy intervention manual and evaluated its effects on common mental health disorders during her PhD studies at UCL, Division of Psychiatry. She has been awarded the PhD degree in 2021. Her main research interests are spirituality, psychology of religion/spirituality, music therapy, applied clinical studies, and mental health. She is now giving several classes for both undergraduate and postgraduate students including the psychology of religion, educational psychology, introduction to psychopathology, faith development, and interventions for spiritual and mental crises. She also interests in poetry and her poems have been published in several literary journals including Dergah, Itibar, Yedi Iklim, and Izdiham.

About the Book

Sufi Music Therapy

This book offers an in-depth exploration of Sufi music therapy, tracing its historical development, theoretical foundations, and practical applications within the broader framework of Islamic mysticism. Drawing from primary Sufi texts, ethnographic accounts, and contemporary studies in music therapy, it examines how music has been used as a spiritual and therapeutic tool in Sufi traditions. The study focuses on the philosophical and theological underpinnings of sound and music in Sufism, emphasizing their role in facilitating spiritual states (hal), remembrance of God (dhikr), and inner transformation. Historical case studies highlight the practices of renowned Sufi orders, such as the Mevlevi and Chishti, demonstrating how musical forms, rhythms, and melodies were tailored to evoke specific emotional and spiritual responses. The work also engages with modern scientific research on the psychological and physiological effects of music, exploring points of convergence with traditional Sufi understandings. Furthermore, it addresses the controversies surrounding music in Islamic jurisprudence, contrasting orthodox objections with Sufi defenses rooted in spiritual experience and healing outcomes. By integrating insights from religious studies, psychology, and musicology, the book presents Sufi music therapy as a multidimensional practice that transcends cultural and temporal boundaries. It concludes that Sufi approaches to music offer valuable perspectives for contemporary music therapy, fostering holistic well-being through the integration of spiritual, emotional, and physical dimensions of healing.

Keywords: Sufi Music Therapy; Islamic Mysticism and Music; Mevlevi and Chishti Orders; Dhikr and Spiritual Healing; Music in Islamic Therapeutic Traditions

Acknowledgements

First and foremost, I would like to express my great appreciation to my primary supervisor Professor Michael King from the Division of Psychiatry, UCL for his unwavering support, sincere guidance, encouragement and infinite patience as a supervisor. I have always found your guidance and judgment calls hugely valuable, keeping me grounded and making me feel well supported, knowing that you have always wanted the best for me. I have been extremely lucky for being your student throughout the course of this research work.

I would like to thank my secondary supervisor Dr Afia Ali from Division of Psychiatry, UCL. I am so grateful that you have always been willing to give me support whenever I needed it. Your optimism has helped me to pick me up when my own motivation or confidence have faltered. I have really valued your help on refining and organising my ideas and your patience on responding to my anxieties and questions. I always feel grateful for being your student along the way.

I would like to express my sincere gratitude to Dr. Bridget Candy from Division of Psychiatry, UCL for her contribution to Chapter 3 and her unwavering support to me in doing a systematic review and meta-analysis. I would also like to offer my special thanks to Dr Nuriye Kupeli from Division of Psychiatry, UCL for her insightful comments and suggestions in Chapter 4. I would like to thank Prof Levent Ozturk, Prof Ahmet Hakki Turabi and Prof Cenk Guray, for their precious contributions and feedbacks in developing the guidance of Sufi music with makams intervention. Special thanks to Merve Cetinkaya for her sincere friendship during this course and for her contribution to conduct the search in Chapter 3.

I am also grateful to the Turkish Ministry of Education for providing me with an extensive scholarship to study this degree. It would have been impossible for me to do a PhD in the UK without that funding.

I would like to express my gratitude to the staff at Newcastle Turkish Community Association for supporting the research, and all the attendees of the centre for participating so wholeheartedly. Without their support and willingness, this work would not have been completed. Thanks also go to Yunus Emre Institute London staff and attendees for supporting and participating in this research.

I would like to extend my sincere thanks to my father, my mother and my brothers for supporting me psychologically and spiritually, chatting things

through whenever I needed, and helping me to keep going. Especially, I feel extremely thankful for the support of my father and my mother. This study was in part inspired and influenced by you both and the words cannot explain my gratitude for being your daughter.

Last but not least, I am deeply grateful to my husband Emre for all his support throughout this process. Thank you for always believing in me and loving me. I could not have done this without you.

Contents

List of Tables -----	xv
List of Figures -----	xvi
1. Introduction; historical and theoretical framework -----	1
1.1. Introduction-----	1
1.1.1. Aim-----	4
1.1.2. Objectives-----	4
1.2. Sufism and music; Harmony of the Hearts-----	6
1.2.1. What is Sufism and what is its position in mental health-----	6
1.2.2. Whirling hearts; music as a therapeutic approach in Sufism-----	9
1.3. Music as Medicine in History, Historical Framework-----	12
1.3.1. Magic, music and religion; a healing triangle-----	13
1.3.2. Music and harmony; music as medicine in Greek Philosophy---	14
1.3.3. The missing link, music therapy in the medieval ages in the East	16
1.3.4. Music and the Renaissance-----	18
1.3.5. Modern music interventions-----	23
1.4. The Theory Behind the Practice: Sufi Music with Makams Intervention Theory-----	32
1.4.1. What is Sufi Music with Makams?-----	33
1.4.2. Application of Sufi makam music therapy in the history of medicine-----	35
1.4.3. How Sufi music with makams intervention functions as a music therapy in mental health-----	38
2. Receptive music therapy's effects on mental health outcomes; an umbrella review of 13 systematic reviews -----	41
2.1. Introduction-----	41
2.2. Method-----	41
2.2.1. <i>Study design</i> -----	41
2.2.2. Aim-----	41
2.2.3. Eligibility Criteria-----	42
2.2.4. Search strategy-----	42

2.2.5. Data extraction -----	43
2.2.6. Quality assessment-----	44
2.2.7. Data analysis-----	44
2.3. Results -----	44
2.3.1. Selection -----	44
2.3.2. Study characteristics -----	45
2.3.3. Quality assessment-----	52
2.3.4. Interventions -----	52
2.3.5. Synthesis of results-----	55
2.4. Discussion-----	59
2.5. Conclusion-----	61

3. The effectiveness of Sufi music for mental health outcomes A systematic review and meta-analysis of 21 randomised trials -----63

3.1. Background -----	63
3.2. Methods-----	64
3.2.1. Aim -----	64
3.2.2. Eligibility Criteria -----	64
3.2.3. Primary Outcomes-----	65
3.2.4. Search Strategy -----	65
3.2.5. Risk of Bias-----	66
3.2.6. Data Extraction and Analysis -----	66
3.2.7. Quality of the evidence -----	67
3.3. Results -----	68
3.3.1. Selection -----	68
3.3.2. Study Characteristics -----	69
3.3.3. Interventions -----	70
3.3.4. Quality Assessment -----	86
3.3.5. Primary Outcome: Anxiety-----	88
3.3.6. Synthesis of Results-----	88
3.3.7. Secondary Outcomes-----	95
3.4. Discussion-----	97
3.4.1. Summary of main findings -----	97

3.4.2. Delivery of the music, outcomes and generalisability-----	98
3.4.3. Quality of the studies and evidence derived -----	98
3.4.4. Strengths and Limitations of the review -----	99
3.5. Conclusion -----	100

4. Makam Music as a Therapeutic Intervention to Reduce Mental

Distress: A Qualitative Study -----	103
4.1. Introduction -----	103
4.2. Methods -----	104
4.2.1. Objectives -----	104
4.2.2. Participants and Setting-----	104
4.2.3. Data Collection -----	111
4.2.4. Data Analysis-----	112
4.3. Findings-----	113
4.3.1. Spirituality and Religion -----	113
4.3.2. Mother Nature -----	115
4.3.3. Music’s whispers to the listeners -----	117
4.3.4. Music, ‘The healer’ -----	120
4.4. Discussion -----	125
4.4.1. Sufi music with makams among other music interventions ----	125
4.4.2. Is Sufi music a spiritual or religious music? -----	126
4.4.3. Emotional considerations of Sufi music with makams-----	127
4.4.4. Strength and Limitations-----	129
4.4.5. Implications for Practice-----	130
4.5. Conclusion -----	130

5. Guideline for the delivery of Sufi music with Makams for people with symptoms of depression or anxiety-----

5.1. Overview -----	133
5.2. Method -----	133
5.3. Development of the Sufi music with makams guideline-----	133
5.3.1. Identifying the theory base: mechanisms behind the intervention	133
5.3.2. Identifying the evidence base: an umbrella review and a systematic review of the literature -----	135

5.3.3. Modelling process and outcomes -----	136
5.4. Feasibility and piloting -----	136
5.4.1. Qualitative study -----	136
5.4.2. Consultations with experts -----	137
5.4.3. Evaluation and implementation -----	138
5.4.4. Feasibility study -----	139
5.5. Conclusion -----	141

6. Sufi music with makams for people with mild to moderate levels of depression and anxiety: a feasibility randomised controlled trial ---- 143

6.1. Introduction -----	143
6.2. Methods -----	144
6.2.1. Study design and settings -----	144
6.2.2. Ethical considerations -----	144
6.2.3. Recruitment and participants -----	144
6.2.4. Randomisation -----	145
6.2.5. The intervention details -----	146
6.2.6. Outcome measures -----	147
6.2.7. Primary endpoint -----	149
6.2.8. Secondary endpoints -----	149
6.2.9. Data Collection Procedures -----	149
6.2.10. Data analysis -----	150
6.3. Results -----	151
6.3.1. Characteristics of participants -----	151
6.3.2. Feasibility Outcomes -----	155
6.3.3. Exploratory Analysis of Primary and Secondary Clinical Outcomes -----	157
6.3.4. Secondary Clinical Outcomes -----	159
6.4. Discussion -----	161
6.4.1. Feasibility Outcomes -----	161
6.4.2. Clinical outcomes -----	163
6.4.3. Strengths and Limitations of the Study -----	165
6.4.4. Future Directions -----	166
6.4.5. Conclusions -----	167

7. Reflexivity -----	169
8. Overall Discussion -----	171
8.1. Introduction -----	171
8.2. Summary of Key Findings-----	171
8.3. Strengths and Limitations -----	175
8.4. Theoretical Implications-----	176
8.4.1. Music therapy vs music medicine -----	176
8.4.2. Complexity of the intervention-----	178
8.4.3. Religious or spiritual music therapy, can we talk about such therapy?-----	178
8.4.4. Sufi music intervention as a spiritual music intervention-----	180
8.5. Clinical Implications-----	182
8.5.1. Implications on acceptability of Sufi music with makams intervention in mental healthcare and in different cultures.-----	182
8.5.2. Implications for Further Research -----	184
8.6. Conclusion -----	185
References -----	187
Appendices -----	211
Appendix 1 : Healing power of the spheres; Eastern music therapy ---	211
Appendix 2: Consent Form, Participant Information Sheet and Ethics Approval Letter of the Qualitative Study-----	217
2.1. Consent Form for Adult Participants in Qualitative Study-----	217
2.2. Participant Information Sheet for the Qualitative Study-----	219
2.3. Ethics Approval Letter for the Qualitative Study-----	222
Appendix 3: Prompts and Questions for Participants in Qualitative Study	224
Appendix 4: Themes, Subthemes and Codes Table -----	225
Appendix 5: Sufi music with makams guideline -----	232
5.1. Summary-----	232
5.2. Introduction -----	232
5.3. Intervention structure and format-----	232
5.4. Role of the stories-----	233

5.5. Choosing the music pieces -----	233
5.6. Choosing the place for intervention -----	234
5.7. General guidelines for facilitating the experience -----	234
5.8. Role of the therapist/ facilitator -----	234
5.9. Materials -----	234
5.10. Overview of all sessions -----	234
5.11. Conclusion -----	239
Appendix 6: Consent Form, Participant Information Sheet and Ethics Approval Letter of Feasibility Randomised Controlled Study -----	240
6.1. Consent Form for the Feasibility Study -----	240
6.2. Participant Information sheet of the feasibility study -----	242
6.3. Ethics Approval Letter for Feasibility Study -----	245
6.4. Permission from Yunus Emre Institute, London for conducting the study -----	247
6.5. Permission from Turkish Community Centre, Newcastle for conducting the study -----	248
6.6. Research poster -----	249
Appendix 7: Demographic questionnaire for participants in feasibility randomised controlled trial -----	249
Appendix 8: Patient Health Questionnaire- 9 (PHQ- 9) -----	251
Appendix 9: Generalized Anxiety Disorder 7-item (GAD-7) scale -----	252
Appendix 10: The Warwick-Edinburgh Mental Well-being Scale (WEMWBS) -----	253
Appendix 11: <i>The Functional Assessment of Chronic Illness Therapy- Spiritual Well-being Scale, a modified version for non-illness (FACIT-SP 12)</i> -----	254

List of Tables

Table 1; Study characteristic of included reviews in the umbrella review.....	47
Table 2; Quality Assessment of the included reviews via AMSTAR 2 Tool	53
Table 3; The effect of receptive music therapy on anxiety in the reviews	56
Table 4; Study characteristics of included studies in the systematic review.....	70
Table 5; Interventions of included studies.....	78
Table 6; Assessment of risk of bias	86
Table 7; GRADE table for music therapy with makams' effect on anxiety against treatment as usual.....	90
Table 8; Participants' characteristics in the qualitative study	107
Table 9; The timeline of measurements.....	150
Table 10; Characteristics of participants of feasibility trial	154
Table 11; Clinical Outcomes- mean scores	157
Table 12; Linear Regression results of all clinical outcomes at T3 (4 weeks).....	158
Table A1.1; Day and makam relationship in Hizir bin Abdullah's Kitabu'l Edvar (Ozcimi, 1989).....	214
Table A1.2; Gevrekzade's list on which makam treat which illnesses	215

List of Figures

Figure 1: Key Elements of the Development, Evaluation and Implementation Process of Complex Interventions (Craig et al., 2008)	5
Figure 2; Maranto's Medical Music Therapy Categories.....	27
Figure 3; Hizir bin Abdullah's Edvars	34
Figure 5; Fatih Darussifa (Sengul, 2008).....	37
Figure 4; Divrigi Darussifa illustration (Sengul, 2008).....	37
Figure 6; Study selection flow chart.....	45
Figure 7; Search and selection of studies for systematic review according to PRISMA	69
Figure 8; The forest plot and results of meta-analysis of music therapy with makams' effects on anxiety against treatment as usual (TAU)	90
Figure 9; The funnel plot for music therapy with makams' effects on anxiety against treatment as usual (TAU).....	91
Figure 10; The forest plot for sensitivity analysis in anxiety including only studies with low risk of bias	92
Figure 11; The forest plot and results of subgroup analyses in terms of measured anxiety type.....	93
Figure 12; The forest plot and results of subgroup analyses in terms of repetition of music therapy intervention	94
Figure 13; Risk of bias graph: risk of bias percentages across all included studies	95
Figure 14; Risk of bias summary: review authors' judgements about each risk of bias item for each included study.	96
Figure 15; Proportion of participants' demographic characteristics	106
Figure 16; The relationship between makam music and religion, spirituality and Sufism according to participants' responses.....	115
Figure 17; The order of makams used in the feasibility study.....	140