

SUFI MUSIC THERAPY WITH MAKAMS

**as a Potential Intervention for
Common Mental Health Disorders**

by Rumeysa Nur Gurbuz-Dogan

Eskiyeni Publications: 142

SUFI MUSIC THERAPY WITH MAKAMS
as a Potential Intervention for Common Mental Health Disorders

by Rumeysa Nur Gurbuz-Dogan

© FCR YAYIN REKLAM BİLGİSAYAR SAN. ve TİC. LTD. ŞTİ.

(Certificate no: 13178)

Design

FCR

Press

NY MATBAACILIK YAYINCILIK

KAĞITÇILIK TİC. VE SAN. LTD. ŞTİ.

Ostim OSB Mh. 1250 Cd. No: 24 Yenimahalle/ANKARA

Tel: (0533) 591 86 17 (Certificate no: 50732)

First printing: November 2022

ISBN: 978-625-7673-54-9

FCR YAYIN REKLAM BİLGİSAYAR SAN. ve TİC. LTD. ŞTİ.

Hacı Bayram Mah. Boyacılar Sk. No: 14/1

Ulus-Altındağ/ANKARA • Tel: (0312) 310 08 60

Web: www.fcr.com.tr • e-mail: fcr@fcr.com.tr

SUFI MUSIC THERAPY WITH MAKAMS

**as a Potential Intervention for
Common Mental Health Disorders**

by Rumeysa Nur Gurbuz-Dogan

Ankara 2022

Rumeysa Nur GURBUZ-DOGAN

Rumeysa Nur Gurbuz-Dogan, PhD, is a lecturer in the division of psychology of religion at the Social Sciences University of Ankara, Turkey. She received her bachelor's in theology at Ankara University in 2013 and then completed her MA at Durham University, the UK, in 2016, under the program of 'Spirituality, Theology, and Health'. She has developed the Sufi music therapy intervention manual and evaluated its effects on common mental health disorders during her PhD studies at UCL, Division of Psychiatry. She has been awarded the PhD degree in 2021. Her main research interests are spirituality, psychology of religion/spirituality, music therapy, applied clinical studies, and mental health. She is now giving several classes for both undergraduate and postgraduate students including the psychology of religion, educational psychology, introduction to psychopathology, faith development, and interventions for spiritual and mental crises. She also interests in poetry and her poems have been published in several literary journals including Dergah, Itibar, Yedi İklim, and Izdiham.

Acknowledgements

First and foremost, I would like to express my great appreciation to my primary supervisor Professor Michael King from the Division of Psychiatry, UCL for his unwavering support, sincere guidance, encouragement and infinite patience as a supervisor. I have always found your guidance and judgment calls hugely valuable, keeping me grounded and making me feel well supported, knowing that you have always wanted the best for me. I have been extremely lucky for being your student throughout the course of this research work.

I would like to thank my secondary supervisor Dr Afia Ali from Division of Psychiatry, UCL. I am so grateful that you have always been willing to give me support whenever I needed it. Your optimism has helped me to pick me up when my own motivation or confidence have faltered. I have really valued your help on refining and organising my ideas and your patience on responding to my anxieties and questions. I always feel grateful for being your student along the way.

I would like to express my sincere gratitude to Dr. Bridget Candy from Division of Psychiatry, UCL for her contribution to Chapter 3 and her unwavering support to me in doing a systematic review and meta-analysis. I would also like to offer my special thanks to Dr Nuriye Kupeli from Division of Psychiatry, UCL for her insightful comments and suggestions in Chapter 4. I would like to thank Prof Levent Ozturk, Prof Ahmet Hakki Turabi and Prof Cenk Guray, for their precious contributions and feedbacks in developing the guidance of Sufi music with makams intervention. Special thanks to Merve Cetinkaya for her sincere friendship during this course and for her contribution to conduct the search in Chapter 3.

I am also grateful to the Turkish Ministry of Education for providing me with an extensive scholarship to study this degree. It would have been impossible for me to do a PhD in the UK without that funding.

I would like to express my gratitude to the staff at Newcastle Turkish Community Association for supporting the research, and all the attendees of the centre for participating so wholeheartedly. Without their support and willingness, this work would not have been completed. Thanks also go to Yunus Emre Institute London staff and attendees for supporting and participating in this research.

I would like to extend my sincere thanks to my father, my mother and my brothers for supporting me psychologically and spiritually, chatting things

through whenever I needed, and helping me to keep going. Especially, I feel extremely thankful for the support of my father and my mother. This study was in part inspired and influenced by you both and the words cannot explain my gratitude for being your daughter.

Last but not least, I am deeply grateful to my husband Emre for all his support throughout this process. Thank you for always believing in me and loving me. I could not have done this without you.

Contents

Acknowledgements	5
Contents	7
List of Tables	13
List of Figures	14
1. Introduction; historical and theoretical framework	15
1.1. Introduction	15
1.1.1. Aim	18
1.1.2. Objectives	18
1.2. Sufism and music; Harmony of the Hearts	20
1.2.1. What is Sufism and what is its position in mental health	20
1.2.2. Whirling hearts; music as a therapeutic approach in Sufism	23
1.3. Music as Medicine in History, Historical Framework	26
1.3.1. Magic, music and religion; a healing triangle	27
1.3.2. Music and harmony; music as medicine in Greek Philosophy	28
1.3.3. The missing link, music therapy in the medieval ages in the East	30
1.3.4. Music and the Renaissance	32
1.3.5. Modern music interventions	37
1.4. The Theory Behind the Practice: Sufi Music with Makams Intervention Theory	46
1.4.1. What is Sufi Music with Makams?	47
1.4.2. Application of Sufi makam music therapy in the history of medicine	49
1.4.3. How Sufi music with makams intervention functions as a music therapy in mental health	52
2. Receptive music therapy's effects on mental health outcomes; an umbrella review of 13 systematic reviews	55
2.1. Introduction	55
2.2. Method	55
2.2.1. <i>Study design</i>	55
2.2.2. Aim	55

2.2.3. Eligibility Criteria -----56

2.2.4. Search strategy-----56

2.2.5. Data extraction -----57

2.2.6. Quality assessment-----58

2.2.7. Data analysis-----58

2.3. Results -----58

2.3.1. Selection -----58

2.3.2. Study characteristics -----59

2.3.3. Quality assessment-----66

2.3.4. Interventions -----66

2.3.5. Synthesis of results-----69

2.4. Discussion-----73

2.5. Conclusion-----75

3. The effectiveness of Sufi music for mental health outcomes A

systematic review and meta-analysis of 21 randomised trials-----77

3.1. Background -----77

3.2. Methods-----78

3.2.1. Aim -----78

3.2.2. Eligibility Criteria -----78

3.2.3. Primary Outcomes-----79

3.2.4. Search Strategy -----79

3.2.5. Risk of Bias-----80

3.2.6. Data Extraction and Analysis -----80

3.2.7. Quality of the evidence -----81

3.3. Results -----82

3.3.1. Selection -----82

3.3.2. Study Characteristics -----83

3.3.3. Interventions -----84

3.3.4. Quality Assessment -----100

3.3.5. Primary Outcome: Anxiety-----102

3.3.6. Synthesis of Results-----102

3.3.7. Secondary Outcomes-----109

3.4. Discussion -----	111
3.4.1. Summary of main findings-----	111
3.4.2. Delivery of the music, outcomes and generalisability-----	112
3.4.3. Quality of the studies and evidence derived -----	112
3.4.4. Strengths and Limitations of the review-----	113
3.5. Conclusion -----	114
4. Makam Music as a Therapeutic Intervention to Reduce Mental Distress: A Qualitative Study -----	117
4.1. Introduction -----	117
4.2. Methods -----	118
4.2.1. Objectives -----	118
4.2.2. Participants and Setting-----	118
4.2.3. Data Collection -----	125
4.2.4. Data Analysis-----	126
4.3. Findings-----	127
4.3.1. Spirituality and Religion -----	127
4.3.2. Mother Nature -----	129
4.3.3. Music's whispers to the listeners -----	131
4.3.4. Music, 'The healer' -----	134
4.4. Discussion -----	139
4.4.1. Sufi music with makams among other music interventions ----	139
4.4.2. Is Sufi music a spiritual or religious music? -----	140
4.4.3. Emotional considerations of Sufi music with makams-----	141
4.4.4. Strength and Limitations-----	143
4.4.5. Implications for Practice-----	144
4.5. Conclusion -----	144
5. Guideline for the delivery of Sufi music with Makams for people with symptoms of depression or anxiety-----	147
5.1. Overview -----	147
5.2. Method-----	147
5.3. Development of the Sufi music with makams guideline-----	147
5.3.1. Identifying the theory base: mechanisms behind the intervention	147

- 5.3.2. Identifying the evidence base: an umbrella review and a systematic review of the literature----- 149
- 5.3.3. Modelling process and outcomes ----- 150
- 5.4. Feasibility and piloting ----- 150
 - 5.4.1. Qualitative study ----- 150
 - 5.4.2. Consultations with experts----- 151
 - 5.4.3. Evaluation and implementation----- 152
 - 5.4.4. Feasibility study ----- 153
- 5.5. Conclusion----- 155

6. Sufi music with makams for people with mild to moderate levels of depression and anxiety: a feasibility randomised controlled trial ---- 157

- 6.1. Introduction----- 157
- 6.2. Methods----- 158
 - 6.2.1. Study design and settings ----- 158
 - 6.2.2. Ethical considerations----- 158
 - 6.2.3. Recruitment and participants----- 158
 - 6.2.4. Randomisation----- 159
 - 6.2.5. The intervention details----- 160
 - 6.2.6. Outcome measures----- 161
 - 6.2.7. Primary endpoint ----- 163
 - 6.2.8. Secondary endpoints----- 163
 - 6.2.9. Data Collection Procedures ----- 163
 - 6.2.10. Data analysis ----- 164
- 6.3. Results ----- 165
 - 6.3.1. Characteristics of participants ----- 165
 - 6.3.2. Feasibility Outcomes ----- 169
 - 6.3.3. Exploratory Analysis of Primary and Secondary Clinical Outcomes ----- 171
 - 6.3.4. Secondary Clinical Outcomes ----- 173
- 6.4. Discussion----- 175
 - 6.4.1. Feasibility Outcomes----- 175
 - 6.4.2. Clinical outcomes ----- 177
 - 6.4.3. Strengths and Limitations of the Study ----- 179

6.4.4. Future Directions -----	180
6.4.5. Conclusions-----	180
7. Reflexivity-----	183
8. Overall Discussion-----	185
8.1. Introduction -----	185
8.2. Summary of Key Findings-----	185
8.3. Strengths and Limitations -----	189
8.4. Theoretical Implications-----	190
8.4.1. Music therapy vs music medicine -----	190
8.4.2. Complexity of the intervention -----	192
8.4.3. Religious or spiritual music therapy, can we talk about such therapy?-----	192
8.4.4. Sufi music intervention as a spiritual music intervention-----	194
8.5. Clinical Implications-----	196
8.5.1. Implications on acceptability of Sufi music with makams intervention in mental healthcare and in different cultures.-----	196
8.5.2. Implications for Further Research -----	198
8.6. Conclusion -----	199
References-----	201
Appendices-----	225
Appendix 1 : Healing power of the spheres; Eastern music therapy ---	225
Appendix 2: Consent Form, Participant Information Sheet and Ethics Approval Letter of the Qualitative Study-----	231
2.1. Consent Form for Adult Participants in Qualitative Study-----	231
2.2. Participant Information Sheet for the Qualitative Study-----	233
2.3. Ethics Approval Letter for the Qualitative Study-----	236
Appendix 3: Prompts and Questions for Participants in Qualitative Study	238
Appendix 4: Themes, Subthemes and Codes Table -----	239
Appendix 5: Sufi music with makams guideline -----	246
5.1. Summary-----	246
5.2. Introduction -----	246

5.3. Intervention structure and format-----	246
5.4. Role of the stories-----	247
5.5. Choosing the music pieces-----	247
5.6. Choosing the place for intervention-----	248
5.7. General guidelines for facilitating the experience-----	248
5.8. Role of the therapist/ facilitator-----	248
5.9. Materials-----	248
5.10. Overview of all sessions-----	248
5.11. Conclusion-----	253
Appendix 6: Consent Form, Participant Information Sheet and Ethics Approval Letter of Feasibility Randomised Controlled Study-----	254
6.1. Consent Form for the Feasibility Study-----	254
6.2. Participant Information sheet of the feasibility study-----	256
6.3. Ethics Approval Letter for Feasibility Study-----	259
6.4. Permission from Yunus Emre Institute, London for conducting the study-----	261
6.5. Permission from Turkish Community Centre, Newcastle for conducting the study-----	262
6.6. Research poster-----	263
Appendix 7: Demographic questionnaire for participants in feasibility randomised controlled trial-----	263
Appendix 8: Patient Health Questionnaire- 9 (PHQ- 9)-----	265
Appendix 9: Generalized Anxiety Disorder 7-item (GAD-7) scale-----	266
Appendix 10: The Warwick-Edinburgh Mental Well-being Scale (WEMWBS)-----	267
Appendix 11: <i>The Functional Assessment of Chronic Illness Therapy- Spiritual Well-being Scale, a modified version for non-illness (FACIT-SP 12)</i> -----	268

List of Tables

Table 1; Study characteristic of included reviews in the umbrella review	61
Table 2; Quality Assessment of the included reviews via AMSTAR 2 Tool	67
Table 3; The effect of receptive music therapy on anxiety in the reviews	70
Table 4; Study characteristics of included studies in the systematic review	85
Table 5; Interventions of included studies	92
Table 6; Assessment of risk of bias	100
Table 7; GRADE table for music therapy with makams' effect on anxiety against treatment as usual	104
Table 8; Participants' characteristics in the qualitative study.....	121
Table 9; The timeline of measurements.....	164
Table 10; Characteristics of participants of feasibility trial	168
Table 11; Clinical Outcomes- mean scores	171
Table 12; Linear Regression results of all clinical outcomes at T3 (4 weeks)	172
Table A1.1; Day and makam relationship in Hizir bin Abdullah's Kitabul Edvar (Ozcimi, 1989).....	228
Table A1.2; Gevrekzade's list on which makam treat which illnesses	229

List of Figures

Figure 1: Key Elements of the Development, Evaluation and Implementation Process of Complex Interventions (Craig et al., 2008)	19
Figure 2; Maranto's Medical Music Therapy Categories	41
Figure 3; Hizir bin Abdullah's Edvars	48
Figure 4; Divrigi Darussifa illustration (Sengul, 2008)	51
Figure 5; Fatih Darussifa (Sengul, 2008)	51
Figure 6; Study selection flow chart	59
Figure 7; Search and selection of studies for systematic review according to PRISMA	83
Figure 8; The forest plot and results of meta-analysis of music therapy with makams' effects on anxiety against treatment as usual (TAU)	104
Figure 9; The funnel plot for music therapy with makams' effects on anxiety against treatment as usual (TAU)	105
Figure 10; The forest plot for sensitivity analysis in anxiety including only studies with low risk of bias	106
Figure 11; The forest plot and results of subgroup analyses in terms of measured anxiety type	107
Figure 12; The forest plot and results of subgroup analyses in terms of repetition of music therapy intervention	108
Figure 13; Risk of bias graph: risk of bias percentages across all included studies	109
Figure 14; Risk of bias summary: review authors' judgements about each risk of bias item for each included study.....	110
Figure 15; Proportion of participants' demographic characteristics.....	120
Figure 16; The relationship between makam music and religion, spirituality and Sufism according to participants' responses.....	129
Figure 17; The order of makams used in the feasibility study	154
Figure 18; Data collection procedure for feasibility study	164
Figure 19; The CONSORT flow chart.....	166
Figure 20; PHQ-9 means over the 4 time-points.....	172
Figure 21; GAD-7 means over the 4 time-points.....	173
Figure 22; WEMWBS means over the 4 time-points.....	174
Figure 23; FACIT-SP12 means over the 4 time-points	175
Figure 24; The steps of the project.....	188
Figure 25; Inclusive music therapy proposal	191
Figure 26; The circular movement in Sufism	195